The Mystery of Tom & Sally

THE MYSTERY OF TOM & SALLY

Session 2 – October 5, 2022

James C. Bays
jcbays@yahoo.com
940.735.2297
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Where We Ended Last Session:

- Was Sally Hemmings Thomas Jefferson’s Unwilling Concubine?

  OR

- Was Sally Hemmings Thomas Jefferson’s Willing Lover?

  OR

- Neither of the Above
The Controversy

James Callender

- Born in Scotland in 1753
- In 1792, Wrote *The Political Progress of Britain*
- In 1793, Charged With Sedition and Emigrated to the United States
The Controversy

James Callender

- In 1796, Wrote *History of 1776*
  - Described an Affair Between Alexander Hamilton and a Married Woman
  - Hamilton Publicly Admitted the Affair
- In 1797, Callender and Jefferson Met
The Controversy

James Callender

- In 1800, Callender Published *The Prospect Before Us*
- Charged and Convicted of Sedition
  - Received a 9-Month Sentence
  - Fined $200
- Released the Last Day of the Adams Administration
The Controversy

James Callender

- After His Election, in 1801 Jefferson Pardoned Callender
- Callender Immediately Sought the Postmaster Job in Richmond
- Jefferson Put Callender Off
- Callender Wrote His Exposé on Sally Hemings and Thomas Jefferson
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

The Controversy

James Callender

- Published His Exposé on September 1, 1802
- Titled the Exposé: The President Again
The Controversy

James Callender

"IT is well known that the man, whom it delighted the people to honor, keeps, and for so many years past has kept as his concubine, one of his own slaves. Her name is SALLY."
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

The Controversy

James Callender

“The name of her eldest son is TOM. His features are said to bear a striking although sable resemblance to those of the president himself. The boy is ten or twelve years of age. His mother went to France in the same vessel with Mr. Jefferson and his two daughters.”
The Controversy

James Callender

“The delicacy of this arrangement must strike every person of common sensibility. What a sublime pattern for an American ambassador to place before the eyes of two young ladies!”
The Controversy

James Callender

“By this wench, Sally, our president has had several children. There is not an individual in the neighborhood of Charlottesville who does not believe the story; and not a few who know it.”
The Controversy

James Callender

“The AFRICAN VENUS is said to officiate as housekeeper at Monticello. When Mr. Jefferson has read this article, he will find leisure to estimate how much has been lost or gained by so many unprovoked attacks upon.

J. T. CALLENDER.”
The Controversy

James Callender – Abigail Adams’ View

“One of the first acts of your administration was to liberate a wretch who was suffering the just punishment of the law due to his crimes for writing and publishing the basest libel, the lowest and vilest slander, which malice could invent or calumny exhibit against the character and reputation of your predecessor.”
The Controversy

James Callender – Abigail Adams’ View

“The serpent you cherished and warmed, bit the hand that nourished him, and gave you sufficient specimens of his talents, his gratitude, his justice, and his truth.”
The Hemings Family

Sally Hemings – What Is Known

- Sally Had at Least Six Children
  - 1795 – Harriet (Died at Age 2)
  - 1798 – Beverley
  - 1799 – Daughter (Died as Infant)
  - 1801 – Harriet
  - 1805 – Madison
  - 1808 – Eston
The Controversy

Madison Hemings

- Madison Was Born at Monticello in 1805
- Tradition Says That Dolley Madison Asked to Name Him
- Jefferson’s Will "Bequeathed" Madison and His Brother Edson to Their Uncle, James Hemings, Until They Reached 21
The Controversy

Madison Hemings

- Madison Lived With Eston and Sally in Charlottesville After Jefferson’s Death
- When Sally Died in 1835, Madison and Eston Moved to Ohio
- Almost 40 Years Later, Madison Dictated His Memoire to S. F. Wetmore of the Ohio Pike County Republican
The Controversy

Madison Hemings

- In His Memoire, Madison Tells His Family Story

- He Says That When His Mother Was in France, She Became Thomas Jefferson’s Concubine and Returned From France “Enciente”

- He Says That Jefferson Agreed to Free Sally’s Children at 21 If She Would Return to Monticello
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

The Controversy

Madison Hemings

- He says that the child Sally was carrying on return from France “lived but a short time”

- But he says that his mother continued to be Jefferson’s concubine, fathering all of her children
The Controversy

Madison Hemings

- Historians Generally Dismissed Madison’s Memoire
- That Is, Until Fawn Brodie Entered the Scene
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

The Controversy

Fawn Brodie

- Brodie Was a Biographer

- In 1974, Brodie Published a “Psychobiography” Entitled:
  
  *Thomas Jefferson: An Intimate History*

- Brodie Claimed That Jefferson Fathered Sally’s Children
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

The Controversy

Fawn Brodie

What Was the Response in the Academic Community?
The Mystery of Tom & Sally
The Controversy

Fawn Brodie

“With but undergraduate and master’s degrees in English, and no apparent formal training in psychology or psychoanalysis, Brodie nevertheless sought to exhume Jefferson’s inner feelings by ‘psychoanalyzing’ his writings.”

Robert F. Turner Forward to Framing a Legend by M Andrew Holochakz
The Controversy

Fawn Brodie

“[Brodie’s] Jefferson biography was a commercial success and earned hundred of thousands of dollars in royalties. It became a Book-of-the-Month selection, and lay reviewers showered it with praise. In contrast, reviews by serious scholars dismissed it as unserious.”

Robert F. Turner Forward to Framing a Legend by M Andrew Holochakz
The Controversy

Fawn Brodie

“[Brodie’s] Jefferson biography was a commercial success and earned hundred of thousands of dollars in royalties. It became a Book-of-the-Month selection, and lay reviewers showered it with praise. In contrast, reviews by serious scholars dismissed it as unserious.”

Robert F. Turner Forward to
Framing a Legend by M Andrew Holochakz
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

The Controversy

Annette Gordon-Reed

- In 1997, Annette Gordon-Reed published *Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings*

- Gordon-Reed is a History Professor at Harvard and a Law Professor at Harvard Law School

- Gordon-Reed made a legal case that Jefferson was more likely than not the father of Sally Heming’s Children
The Controversy

Annette Gordon-Reed

“The Gordon-Reed volume appeared at a time when it was popular to try to topple the great ‘dead white males’ of American history. As Mount Holyoke professor Joseph Ellis has observed, Thomas Jefferson is the ‘dead-white-male who matters most’ and the ‘most valued trophy in the cultural wars.’”

Robert F. Turner Forward to Framing a Legend by M Andrew Holochakz

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>1750</th>
<th>1760</th>
<th>1770</th>
<th>1780</th>
<th>1790</th>
<th>1800</th>
<th>1810</th>
<th>1820</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGE</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Controversy

Nature Magazine

In November 1998, Nature Magazine published an article entitled:

Jefferson Fathered Slave’s Last Child
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

The Controversy

*Nature Magazine*

- The Article Was Based on the Results of DNA Testing on Descendants and Possible Descendants of Thomas Jefferson and Sally Hemings

- The Study Was Conducted by a University of Virginia Pathologist
“[The study sought to assess] Thomas Jefferson's paternity of the children of Sally Hemings, one of his slaves. To throw some scientific light on the dispute, we have compared Y-chromosomal DNA haplotypes from male-line descendants of Field Jefferson, a paternal uncle of Thomas Jefferson, with those of male-line descendants of Thomas Woodson, Sally Hemings' putative first son, and of Eston Hemings Jefferson, her last son.”
The Controversy

Nature Magazine

- Study Methodology
  - Tested Y-Chromosome Structures of the DNA of Five Male Jefferson Family Male-Line Descendants
  - Detected a Rare “Microsatellite Haplotype” That Has Been Detected Only in the Jefferson Male Line
The Controversy

*Nature Magazine*

- Test Results – Thomas Woodson
  - Tested Male-Line Male Descendants of Thomas Woodson
  - They *Did Not* Have the Rare Jefferson DNA Trait
The Controversy

Nature Magazine

- Test Results – Dabney Carr

- Tested Male-Line Male Descendants of Dabney Carr

- They **Did Not** Have the Rare Jefferson DNA Trait

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>1750</th>
<th>1760</th>
<th>1770</th>
<th>1780</th>
<th>1790</th>
<th>1800</th>
<th>1810</th>
<th>1820</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGE</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Childhood
- Student/Lawyer
- Married
- France
- SS & VP
- President
- Retired
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

The Controversy

*Nature Magazine*

- Test Results – Monticello Neighbors
  - Tested Male-Line Male Descendants of Various Monticello Neighbors
  - They **Did Not** Have the Rare Jefferson DNA Trait

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>1750</th>
<th>1760</th>
<th>1770</th>
<th>1780</th>
<th>1790</th>
<th>1800</th>
<th>1810</th>
<th>1820</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGE</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>66</td>
<td></td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Childhood
- Student/Lawyer
- Married
- France
- SS & VP
- President
- Retired
The Controversy

*Nature Magazine*

- Test Results – Eston Hemings
  - Tested Male-Line Male
    Descendants of Sally Heming’s Youngest Son, Eston
  - They **Did** Have the Rare Jefferson DNA Trait
The Controversy

Nature Magazine

Conclusion

“The molecular findings fail to support the belief that Thomas Jefferson was Thomas Woodson's father, but provide evidence that he was the biological father of Eston Hemings.”
The Controversy

The Scholars Commission

- In 2000, the Thomas Jefferson Heritage Commission Engaged 13 Historians to Investigate the Alleged Jefferson-Hemings Affair

- A Year Later the “Scholars Commission” Delivered Its Report
The Controversy

The Scholars Commission

- In 2001 The Scholars Commission Concluded That Evidence Was Insufficient to Establish Jefferson’s Paternity of Sally Hemings’ Children
The Controversy

Annette Gordon-Reed’s Response

- Gordon-Reed Responded With a Second Book on the Issue:
  
  *The Hemingses of Monticello*

  And Won a Pulitzer Price.
  
- This Really Annoyed the Self-Proclaimed “Serious Scholars”
The Controversy

The "Serious Scholars" Response

"Professor Gordon-Reed and her new book received virtually every award for which they might have been eligible, including the Pulitzer Prize in History, the National Book Award, the National Humanities Medal from the president of the United States, a half-million dollar 'genius grant' from the MacArthur Foundation, and induction into the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. Harvard University appointed her to three professorships, including law and history."
Is It True?

One Man’s Opinion:

Dumas Malone’s Response to the Charges:

“They are distinctly out of character, being virtually unthinkable in a man of Jefferson’s moral standards and habitual conduct.”
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Arguments That It Is Not True

- Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.
- Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.
- Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.
Is It True?

Arguments That It Is Not True

- Madison Hemings Was “Played” by the Pike County Reporter.

- Another Jefferson Man Could Have Been the Father of Sally Hemings’ Children.

- Everyone in the Household Would Have Known If They Had Had a Relationship.
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- Before Martha
  - Rebecca Burwell - 1763

  “I had dressed up in my own mind, such thoughts as occurred to me, in as moving language as I knew how, and expected to have performed in a tolerably creditable manner. But, good God!”
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- Before Martha
  - Rebecca Burwell - 1763
    
    “When I had an opportunity of venting them, a few broken sentences, uttered in great disorder, and interrupted with pauses of uncommon length were to too visible signs of my strange confusion.”
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- Before Martha
  - Rebecca Burwell - 1763

“St. Paul only says that it is better to be married than to burn . . . .
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- Before Martha
  - Rebecca Burwell - 1763

  "... Now I presume that if that apostle had known that providence would at an after day be so kind to any particular set of people as furnish them with other means of extinguishing their fire other than matrimony, he would have earnestly recommended them to their practice."
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- Before Martha
  - Rebecca Burwell - 1763

“I verily believe Page that I shall die soon, and yet I can give no other reason for it but that I am tired with living. At this moment when I am writing I am scarcely sensible that I exist.

“Adieu Dear Page.”
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- Before Martha
  - Elizabeth (Betsy) Walker - 1768
    - John Walker Was Jefferson’s “Old and Deep” Friend
    - In 1764, John Walker Married Elizabeth (Betsy) Moore
  - Jefferson Was a Groomsman
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- Before Martha
  - Elizabeth (Betsy) Walker - 1768
    - The Walkers Lived 5 Miles From Shadwell
    - In 1768 John Walker Was Appointed to a Delegation to Negotiate a Treaty with Indians in New York
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- Before Martha
  - Elizabeth (Betsy) Walker - 1768
    - While John Walker Was Away, Jefferson Fell in Love With Betsy
    - Jefferson Made Repeated (Unsuccessful) Attempts to Seduce Betsy
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- Before Martha
  - Elizabeth (Betsy) Walker - 1768
    - Walker Found Out Years Later About Jefferson’s Attempts to Seduce His Wife
    - Ultimately, Walker Challenged Jefferson to a Duel
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- Before Martha
  - Elizabeth (Betsy) Walker - 1768
    - Jefferson Apologized

"[W]hen young and single I offered love to a handsome lady. I acknowledge its incorrectness."

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>1750</th>
<th>1760</th>
<th>1770</th>
<th>1780</th>
<th>1790</th>
<th>1800</th>
<th>1810</th>
<th>1820</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGE</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>66</td>
<td></td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Mystery of Tom & Sally
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway - 1786
    - Maria Was Italian by Birth
    - Married Englishman Richard Cosway
    - The Cosways Lived in London with Commissions in Paris
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway - 1786
    - Maria and Richard Cosway Came to Paris
    - Richard Was a Miniaturist
    - Apparently, Maria and Richard Lived Separate Lives
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway
    - Maria Was an Accomplished Artist in Her Own Right
    - She Was Also an Accomplished Musician

The Mystery of Tom & Sally

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>1750</th>
<th>1760</th>
<th>1770</th>
<th>1780</th>
<th>1790</th>
<th>1800</th>
<th>1810</th>
<th>1820</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGE</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway
    - Maria Was Very Attractive and Very Engaging
      - “a golden-haired, languishing Anglo-Italian, graceful to affection, and highly accomplished, especially in music.”
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway
    - Jefferson Was Introduced to Maria in August 1786 by Angelica Church
    - Jefferson Immediately Canceled His Dinner Plans in Order to Have Dinner With Cosway
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway
    - Jefferson and Maria Were Inseparable for the Next Six Weeks
    - The Adventure Ended When Jefferson Broke His Right Wrist
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway

“It was by one of those follies from which good cannot come, but ill may.”
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway
    - Maria and Richard Returned to London
    - Jefferson Wrote Maria His “Head and Heart” Letter
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway
    - Jefferson’s Most Revealing Comment

“Living from day to day, without a plan for four and twenty hours to come, I form no catalogue of impossible events. . . .

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>1750</th>
<th>1760</th>
<th>1770</th>
<th>1780</th>
<th>1790</th>
<th>1800</th>
<th>1810</th>
<th>1820</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGE</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Mystery of Tom & Sally
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway
    - Jefferson’s Most Revealing Comment

“. . . Laid up in port, for life as I thought myself at one time, I am thrown out to sea, and an unknown one to me.”
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With Another Woman After Martha’s Death.

- After Martha
  - Maria Cosway
    - Jefferson and Cosway Never Saw Each Other Again
    - But They Did Correspond
    - Maria Left Richard and Her Daughter to Live With an Italian Opera Singer
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

In *Notes of Virginia*, Jefferson Had Said . . .

“I advance it therefore as a suspicion only, that the blacks, whether originally a distinct race, or made distinct by time and circumstance, are inferior to the whites in the endowments both of body and mind.”
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- In Notes of Virginia, Jefferson Had Said . . .

“The improvement of the blacks in body and mind, in the first instance of their mixture of the whites, has been observed by every one, and proves that their inferiority is not the effect merely of their condition of life.”
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- Annette Gordon-Reed’s Comment:

  “[Jefferson] existed in a society where a slave master taking a slave as a mistress, though frowned upon, was not unheard of. All that was required was discretion on the part of those involved and those who knew of it.”
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- The Case of Thomas Bell and Mary Hemings
  - During the 1780s, Jefferson leased one of his slaves – Mary Hemings – to a Charlottesville merchant, Thomas Bell

- Mary was Sally’s half-sister

---

**The Mystery of Tom & Sally**

---

**Timeline of Thomas Jefferson**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>1750</th>
<th>1760</th>
<th>1770</th>
<th>1780</th>
<th>1790</th>
<th>1800</th>
<th>1810</th>
<th>1820</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AGE</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td></td>
<td>39</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Childhood**
- **Student/Lawyer**
- **Married**
- **France**
- **SS & VP**
- **President**
- **Retired**
Is It True?

**Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.**

- The Case of Thomas Bell and Mary Hemings
  - Mary Hemings and Bell Became Lovers
  - They Had Two Children
  - Mary Asked Jefferson to Sell Her and Her Two Children to Bell
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- The Case of Thomas Bell and Mary Hemings
  - Jefferson Agreed
  - Mary and Thomas Bell Lived Together for the Rest of Bell’s Life
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- The Case of George Wythe
  - George Wythe Was Jefferson’s Long-Time Mentor

  “George Wythe had risen as usual on Sunday, May 25, 1806, and eaten breakfast at home. . . .

Thomas Jefferson: The Art of Power by Jon Meacham
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- The Case of George Wythe
  - George Wythe Was Jefferson’s Long-Time Mentor

  "... At around nine o’clock that morning, he was sick to his stomach; the rest of the household was stricken too."

Thomas Jefferson: The Art of Power by Jon Meacham
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- The Case of George Wythe
  - George Wythe Was Jefferson’s Long-Time Mentor
  
  "One member, a mixed race teenager named Michael Brown, died a few days later. William Duval, a magistrate, was suspicious and ordered an autopsy."

Thomas Jefferson: The Art of Power by Jon Meacham
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- The Case of George Wythe
  - George Wythe Was Jefferson’s Long-Time Mentor

"Four physicians attended, Duval told Jefferson ‘from the inflammation on the stomach and bowels they said that it was the kind of inflammation produced by poison.’"

Thomas Jefferson: The Art of Power by Jon Meacham
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- The Case of George Wythe
  - George Wythe Was Jefferson’s Long-Time Mentor

  "The culprit was presumably George Sweeney, a Wythe grandnephew whose motives, if he did it, may have included jealously and money."

  Thomas Jefferson: The Art of Power by Jon Meacham
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- The Case of George Wythe
  - Wythe Died as Well
  - Twice Widowed, Wythe Had Lived With a Free Black Woman, Lydia Brodnax
  - In His Will, Wythe Left His Estate to Lydia and Named Jefferson as Michael’s Guardian
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.

- The Case of George Wythe
  - Was Michael Brown the Son of Lydia and Wythe?
  - What Does Jefferson’s Appointment as Michael’s Guardian Suggest?
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Woman of African Descent.
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.

- Review of the Bidding
  - Jefferson Decided to Bring Polly to France in May 1785
  - He Had His Dalliance With Maria Cosway During the Summer and Fall of 1786
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.

- Review of the Bidding
  - At the Same Time Jefferson Was Arranging for Polly’s Trip
  - Jefferson Originally Requested a “Mature” Chaperone for Polly

  “A careful negro woman, as Isabel, . . . if she has had the small-pox, would suffice.”
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.

- Review of the Bidding
  - Isabel Was Pregnant
  - So Aunt Eppes Sent 14-Year-Old Sally Hemings With Polly
  - When They Arrived in England, They Were Dispatched to John and Abigail Adams
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.

- Review of the Bidding
  - Abigail Wrote Jefferson:
    “The old nurse whom you expected to have attended [Polly] was sick and unable to come.”
    “She has a girl about 15 or 16 with her, the sister of the servant you have with you.”
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.

- Review of the Bidding
  - Jon Meacham:
    
    "It is a reasonable surmise that the Sally Hemings who arrived in Europe in the summer of 1787 was physically desirable."
Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.

- Review of the Bidding
  - Madison Claims His Mother Started a Sexual Relationship With Jefferson in the 30 Months or So She Was in Paris
  - Madison Claims His Mother Was Impregnated and Negotiated Her “Deal” With Thomas Jefferson
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.

- Would That Have Been Seen as Outrageous at the Time?
  - Thomas Mann Randolph
    - Patsy’s Father in Law
    - Married Gabriella Harvie When He Was 50
  - Gabriella Was 17

![Timeline Image]
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.

- Would That Have Been Seen as Outrageous at the Time?
- John Marshall
  - In 1783, John Marshall Married Mary Ambler
  - Marshall Was 31 and Mary Was 16
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.

- Would That Have Been Seen as Outrageous at the Time?
  - James Madison
    - Before He Met Dolley, Madison Fell in Love With Catherine ("Kitty") Floyd
    - Kitty Was 15; Madison 31
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.

- Would That Have Been Seen as Outrageous at the Time?

  - James Madison

    “[The marriage would] render you happier than you can possibly be in a single state.”

Jefferson to Madison
Is It True?

**Jefferson Would Not Have Had a Sexual Relationship With a Teenager.**

Would That Have Been Seen as Outrageous at the Time?

“If the forty-four-year-old Thomas Jefferson could be characterized as something on the order of a child molester for having allegedly started a relationship with a female who was either fifteen or sixteen, then one must also question his friend the adult James Madison who courted a female of the same age.”

Annette Gordon Reed
Is It True?

Madison Hemings Was “Played” by the Pike County Reporter.

- The Madison Hemings “Memoire” Was Written by S. F. Wetmore
  - Editor of the *Pike County Republican*
  - Published a Series of Interviews With Elderly Citizens
  - Focused on Former Slaves
Is It True?

Madison Hemings Was “Played” by the Pike County Reporter.

- The Madison Hemings “Memoire” Was Written by S. F. Wetmore
  - Previously, Wetmore Had Been a Federal District Marshall
  - As the Federal Marshall, He Had Taken the 1870 Census of Pike County
  - Appointed Postmaster in 1873
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Madison Hemings Was “Played” by the Pike County Reporter.

- Deniers’ Claims
  - Wetmore Was a Republican Operative
  - Some of Madison Hemings’ Statements Were Not True
  - Madison Hemings Would Not Have Used the Term “Enciente”

Enciente = Pregnant
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Madison Hemings Was “Played” by the Pike County Reporter.

Deniers’ Claims

- Madison Hemings Held a Grudge Against Jefferson
- Wetmore Talked Madison Hemings Into Believing He Was Thomas Jefferson’s Son
Is It True?

Madison Hemings Was “Played” by the Pike County Reporter.

o A Quick Geography Lesson
Is It True?

Madison Hemings Was “Played” by the Pike County Reporter.

A Quick Geography Lesson
Is It True?

Madison Hemings Was “Played” by the Pike County Reporter.
Is It True?

Madison Hemings Was “Played” by the Pike County Reporter.

This man is the son of Thomas Jefferson!

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>Childhood</th>
<th>Student/Lawyer</th>
<th>Married</th>
<th>France</th>
<th>SS &amp; VP</th>
<th>President</th>
<th>Retired</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Another Jefferson Man Could Have Been the Father of Sally Hemings’ Children.

- Deniers’ Claims
  - Originally, They Claimed That Dabney Carr’s Sons Fathered Sally’s Children
  - DNA Testing Excluded the Carrs
  - So, Now They Note There Were Other Jefferson Men Around Monticello
Conception & Birth of Sally Hemings’ Children

○ = Likely Conception    ★ = Birth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>YEAR</th>
<th>1795</th>
<th>1796</th>
<th>1797</th>
<th>1798</th>
<th>1799</th>
<th>1800</th>
<th>1801</th>
<th>1802</th>
<th>1803</th>
<th>1804</th>
<th>1805</th>
<th>1806</th>
<th>1807</th>
<th>1808</th>
<th>1809</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>☀</td>
<td>★</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Mystery of Tom & Sally

The image includes a timeline and a chart detailing the likely conceptions and births of Sally Hemings' children. The timeline spans from 1795 to 1808, with specific years marked for conceptions and births. The chart uses symbols (○ and ★) to indicate likely conceptions and births, respectively. The image also features a portrait of a historical figure, possibly related to the historical context described in the text.
Is It True?

Everyone in the Household Would Have Known If They Had Had a Relationship.

- Discretion
  - One Obvious Fact:
    - Jefferson Designed Monticello
  - Second Obvious Fact:
    - Jefferson Redesigned Monticello on His Return from France
Is It True?

Everyone in the Household Would Have Known If They Had Had a Relationship.
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Everyone in the Household Would Have Known If They Had Had a Relationship.

- Sally Hemings’ Quarters Would Have Made Discretion Possible
Is It True?

Everyone in the Household Would Have Known If They Had Had a Relationship.

- Sally Hemings’ Quarters Would Have Made Discretion Possible
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Everyone in the Household Would Have Known If They Had Had a Relationship.

- Sally Hemings’ Quarters Would Have Made Discretion Possible
Is It True?

Everyone in the Household Would Have Known If They Had Had a Relationship.

- Sally Hemings’ Quarters Would Have Made Discretion Possible
Is It True?

Everyone in the Household Would Have Known If They Had Had a Relationship.

- Sally Hemings’ Quarters Would Have Made Discretion Possible
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Everyone in the Household Would Have Known If They Had Had a Relationship.

... And the Family ...

Hear No Evil

See No Evil

Speak No Evil

YEAR | 1750 | 1760 | 1770 | 1780 | 1790 | 1800 | 1810 | 1820
---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---
AGE | Childhood | Student/Lawyer | Married | France | SS & VP | President | Retired | 83
  | 14 | 29 | 39 | 46 | 58 | 66 | 83 |
Is It True?

**Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.**

- Beverly Hemings
  - Born 1798 – Turned 21 in 1819
  - In 1822, Beverly Ran Away
  - Jefferson Made No Attempt to Bring Beverly Back
Is It True?

**Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.**

- Harriet Hemings
  - Born 1801 – Turned 21 in 1822
  - In 1822 – After Beverly Had Run Away – Jefferson Freed Harriet
Is It True?

Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.

- Harriet Hemings
  - According to Edmund Bacon
    
    "When she was nearly grown, by Mr. Jefferson’s direction I paid her stage fare to Philadelphia and gave her fifty dollars. I have never seen her since, and don’t know what became of her.”
Is It True?

Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.

- Harriet Hemings
  - According to Edmund Bacon

“She was nearly as white as anybody, and very beautiful.”
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.

- Madison Hemings
  - Born 1805 – Turned 21 in 1826

- Eston Hemings
  - Born 1808 – Turned 21 in 1829

- When Jefferson Died Madison Was 21 or 22 and Eston Was 19
Is It True?

Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.

- Madison and Eston Hemings
- Under Virginia Law
  - Unless Approved by the Virginia Legislature, a Freed Slave Was Required to Leave the State Within One Year of Manumission
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.

- Madison and Eston Hemings
- Under Virginia Law
  - Creditors Could Levy Against a Freed Slave for Payment of Debts
Is It True?

Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.

- Madison and Eston Hemings
  - In His Will Jefferson Freed John Hemings and Two Other Skilled Slaves
  - In Addition, Jefferson Bequeathed Madison and Eston to John Hemings Until They Turned 21
Is It True?

Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.

Jefferson’s Will

“I give also to John Hemings the services of his two apprentices, Madison and Eston Hemings, until their respective ages of twenty one years, at which period respectively, I give them their freedom. . . .

The Mystery of Tom & Sally
Is It True?

Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.

- Jefferson’s Will

“. . . and I humbly and earnestly request of the legislature of Virginia a confirmation of the bequest of freedom to these servants . . .

The Mystery of Tom & Sally
Is It True?

Jefferson Did Not Free All of Sally Hemings’ Children at Age 21 as He Allegedly “Promised” Sally.

Jefferson’s Will

“. . . with permission to remain in this state where their families and connections are, as an additional instance of the favor, of which I have received so many other manifestations, in the course of my life, and for which I now give them my last, solemn, and dutiful thanks.”
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Anecdotal Evidence – That It’s True

- Eston’s Physical Appearance
- Sally’s Sons All Played the Violin
- John Hartwell Cocke’s Diary

“Mr. Jefferson’s notorious example.”
Is It True?

Anecdotal Evidence – That It’s True

Sarah Presenting Hagar to Abraham

Adriaen van der Werff (1699)
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

Anecdotal Evidence – That It’s False

- Edmond Bacon
  - Claimed He Had Seen Another Man Come Out of Sally Hemings’ Quarters Early in the Morning
  - Mystery of the “First Child”
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?
- What Standard of Proof?
  - Beyond a Reasonable Doubt?
  - Preponderance of Evidence?
  - Clear and Convincing Proof?
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Is It True?

What Do You Find Convincing?
Is It True?

What I Find Convincing?

Harriet’s Release in 1822

Thomas Jefferson in 1819:

“[I fear] that the overseers do not permit the women to devote as much time as is necessary to the care of their children: that they view their labor as the 1st object and the raising of their child but secondary.”
Is It True?

What I Find Convincing?

Harriet’s Release in 1822

Thomas Jefferson in 1819:

“I consider the labor of a breeding woman* as no object, and that a child raised every 2. years is of more profit than the crop of the best laboring man.”

* I.e., one of child bearing age
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

That's all Folks!
The Mystery of Tom & Sally

Don’t Forget to Do Your Class Evaluations!

And, Thanks for Your Participation